

Is the Schwarzschild black hole really stable? *

Guihua Tian^{1,2}, Shikun Wang², Zhao Zheng³

1.School of Science, Beijing University
of Posts And Telecommunications. Beijing100876, China.

2.Academy of Mathematics and Systems Science,
Chinese Academy of Sciences,(CAS) Beijing, 100080, P.R. China,

3.Department of Physics, Beijing Normal University, Beijing100875, China.

April 18, 2005

Abstract

The stability of the Schwarzschild black hole is studied. Regge and Wheeler treated the problem first at 1957 and obtained the dynamical equations for the small perturbation. There are two kinds of perturbations: odd one and even one. Using the Painlevé coordinate, we reconsider the odd perturbation and find that: the **white-hole-connected universe** ($r > 2m$, see text) is unstable. Because the odd perturbation may be regarded as the angular perturbation, therefore, the physical mean to it may be that the **white-hole-connected universe** is unstable with respect to the rotating perturbation.

PACC:0420-q

Studies concerning the stability of the Schwarzschild black hole may step back to the work of the Regge and Wheeler, who first divided the perturbation into odd and even ones [1]. Later, it is found that odd one is really the angular perturbation to the metric, while even one corresponds to the radial perturbation to the metric [2].

Vishveshwara made the study further by transforming the perturbation quantities to the Kruskal reference frame, and tried to find the real divergence at $r = 2m$ from the spurious one caused by the improper choice of coordinate due to the Schwarzschild metric's ill-defined-ness at $r = 2m$ [3]. Later, Price also studied the problem carefully [4] and Wald studied from the mathematical background [5].

In reference [6], Stewart applied the Liapounoff theorem to define dynamical stability of a black-hole. First, according Stewart, the normal mode of the perturbation fields to the Schwarzschild black-hole is the perturbation fields Ψ with time-dependence of e^{-ikt} which are bounded at the boundaries of the event horizon $r = 2m$ and the infinity $r \rightarrow \infty$. The range of permitted frequency is defined as the spectrum S of the Schwarzschild black-hole. Then, for the Schwarzschild black-hole, it could be obtained by the Liapounoff theorem that[6]:

- (1)if $\exists k \in S$ with $\Im k > 0$, the Schwarzschild black-hole is dynamically unstable,
- (2)if $\Im k < 0$ for $\forall k \in S$, and the normal modes are complete, then, the Schwarzschild black-hole is dynamically stable,
- (3)if $\Im k \leq 0$ for $\forall k \in S$, and there is at least one real frequency $k \in S$, the linearized approach could not decide the stability of the Schwarzschild black-hole.

Vishveshwara proved the normal mode of the Schwarzschild black-hole could be real. Therefore, strictly speaking, the stability of the Schwarzschild black-hole is unsolved according to this criterion of Stewart's definition.

Here, we reconsider the stability problem of the Schwarzschild black hole using the Painlevé coordinate metric(see following). The conclusions are: for the **white-hole-connected universe** of the Schwarzschild space-time(see following), there exists frequencies with $\Im k > 0$. So, the **white-hole-connected universe** of the Schwarzschild space-time is unstable.

*E-mail of Tian: xinda-2002@126.com, hua2007@126.com, tgh-2000@263.net

Recently, in studying the Hawking radiation as tunnelling [7], the Schwarzschild coordinates is replaced by the Painlevé coordinates, which were discovered independent by Painlevé in 1921[8] and Kraus, Wilczek in 1994 [9], [10]. The Painlevé metric is stationary and regular at the horizon [9], [10]. This good quality makes it more suitable for studying the stability of the Schwarzschild black hole.

In the following, we first introduce the Painlevé coordinate metric for the Schwarzschild black hole, then using the Vishveshwara's result, we transform the odd perturbation quantities to the Painlevé coordinate system, and study the problem.

The Schwarzschild metric is

$$ds^2 = -\left(1 - \frac{2m}{r}\right)dt_s^2 + \left(1 - \frac{2m}{r}\right)^{-1}dr^2 + r^2d\Omega^2. \quad (1)$$

By

$$t_p = t_s - \left[2\sqrt{2mr} + 2m \ln \frac{\sqrt{r} - \sqrt{2m}}{\sqrt{r} + \sqrt{2m}} \right], \quad (2)$$

we obtain the Painlevé metric of the black hole,

$$\begin{aligned} ds^2 &= -\left(1 - \frac{2m}{r}\right)dt_p^2 - 2\sqrt{\frac{2m}{r}}drdt_p + dr^2 + r^2d\Omega^2 \\ &= -dt_p^2 + \left(dr - \sqrt{\frac{2m}{r}}dt_p\right)^2 + r^2d\Omega^2. \end{aligned} \quad (3)$$

The Painlevé metric (3) is well-behaved at the horizon. It is obvious that the radial null geodesics are

$$\frac{dr}{dt_p} = \pm 1 + \sqrt{\frac{2m}{r}} \quad (4)$$

respectively. The upper and lower classes correspond to the outgoing and ingoing null geodesics. In the usual Penrose diagram, part *I* corresponds to our universe ($r > 2m$), parts *II* and *II'* are the black-hole ($r < 2m$) and white-hole ($r < 2m$) respectively, and part *I'* is another universe ($r > 2m$) not communicating with our universe.

Clearly, the metric (3) represents the region *I* and *II'* in the Penrose diagram. We define the universe *I* connected with *II'* by the metric (3) as the **white-hole-connected universe**.

If we transform the metric (1) by

$$t_p = t_s + \left[2\sqrt{2mr} + 2m \ln \frac{\sqrt{r} - \sqrt{2m}}{\sqrt{r} + \sqrt{2m}} \right], \quad (5)$$

we obtain another Painlevé metric of the black hole:

$$ds^2 = -\left(1 - \frac{2m}{r}\right)dt_p^2 + 2\sqrt{\frac{2m}{r}}drdt_p + dr^2 + r^2d\Omega^2 \quad (6)$$

The Painlevé metric (6) is also regular at the horizon. The radial outgoing and ingoing null geodesics are

$$\frac{dr}{dt_p} = \pm 1 - \sqrt{\frac{2m}{r}} \quad (7)$$

respectively. Similarly, the metric (6) represents the region *I* ($r > 2m$, our universe) and *II* ($r < 2m$, the black hole) in the Penrose diagram. We define the universe *I* connected with *II* by the metric (6) as the **black-hole-connected universe**.

Here, we briefly explain the perturbation of the Schwarzschild black hole.

Suppose the background metric is $g_{\mu\nu}$, while the perturbation in it is $h_{\mu\nu}$, the contract Ricci tensors $R_{\mu\nu}$, $R_{\mu\nu} + \delta R_{\mu\nu}$ correspond the metrics $g_{\mu\nu}$, $g_{\mu\nu} + h_{\mu\nu}$ respectively. The non-linear perturbation equation is

$$\delta R_{\mu\nu} = 0, \quad (8)$$

while the linear part with respect to $h_{\mu\nu}$ in the equation (8) is called the perturbation field equation. After the consideration of the gauge freedom, the odd perturbation is

$$h_{\mu\nu} = \begin{vmatrix} 0 & 0 & 0 & h_0(r) \\ 0 & 0 & 0 & h_1(r) \\ 0 & 0 & 0 & 0 \\ h_0(r) & h_1(r) & 0 & 0 \end{vmatrix} e^{-ikt_s} \left[\sin \theta \frac{\partial}{\partial \theta} \right] P_l(\cos \theta),$$

and the even one is

$$h_{\mu\nu} = \begin{vmatrix} H_0(1 - \frac{2m}{r}) & H_1 & 0 & 0 \\ H_1 & H_2(1 - \frac{2m}{r})^{-1} & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 0 & r^2 K & 0 \\ 0 & 0 & 0 & r^2 K \sin^2 \theta \end{vmatrix} e^{-ikt_s} P_l(\cos \theta).$$

Here we mainly discuss the odd perturbation.

In the odd perturbation, the linear equations of (8) are combined into one single equation, that is, the Regge-Wheeler equation:

$$\frac{d^2 Q}{dr^{*2}} + [k^2 - V] Q = 0, \quad (9)$$

where the effective potential V and the tortoise coordinate are

$$V = \left(1 - \frac{2m}{r}\right) \left[\frac{l(l+1)}{r^2} - \frac{6m}{r^3} \right], \quad (10)$$

$$r^* = r + 2m \ln \left(\frac{r}{2m} - 1 \right) \quad (11)$$

respectively. The perturbation field $h_0(r)$ and $h_1(r)$ are connected with Q by

$$h_0(r) = \frac{i}{k} \frac{d}{dr^*} (rQ) = \frac{i}{k} \left[\left(1 - \frac{2m}{r}\right) Q + r \frac{dQ}{dr^*} \right] \quad (12)$$

and

$$h_1(r) = r \left(1 - \frac{2m}{r}\right)^{-1} Q. \quad (13)$$

The Schwarzschild black hole is unstable if initially well-behaved, the perturbation fields are growing in time. In the odd perturbation case, that is, $h_0(r)$ and $h_1(r)$ are well-behaved initially in the range $(2m, \infty)$ or $(-\infty, +\infty)$ by the tortoise coordinate r^* , and at least one of them run into infinity when time increases to infinity. Just as stated before, if the imaginary part $\Im k$ of the frequency k is greater than zero, then the black hole is unstable with respect to the perturbation. Vishveshwara showed $\Re k = 0, \Im k > 0$ is impossible in reference [3]. Here, we will prove that $\Re k = 0, \Im k > 0$ is possible for the **white-hole-connected universe**.

As stated before, the Schwarzschild metric is singular at $r = 2m$, so, we could not discuss the problem under this metric. The metric (3) is regular at the horizon, so we study the perturbation under this metric. Just as done in the reference ([3]), we get the perturbation field quantities in the Schwarzschild metric coordinates for simplification, then we obtain the corresponding quantities in the metric (3) of Painlevé coordinates by transformation and study the stable problem.

By equation (2), it is easy to get the perturbation fields $[h_{ij}^p]$ in the metric (3) of Painlevé coordinates:

$$h_{03}^p = h_{03}^s \quad (14)$$

$$h_{13}^p = h_{13}^s + \sqrt{\frac{2m}{r}} \left(1 - \frac{2m}{r}\right)^{-1} h_{03}^s \quad (15)$$

where

$$h_{03}^s = h_0 e^{-ikt_s} = \frac{i}{k} \left[\left(1 - \frac{2m}{r}\right) Q + r \frac{dQ}{dr^*} \right] e^{-ikt_s} \quad (16)$$

$$h_{13}^s = h_1 e^{-ikt_s} = r \left(1 - \frac{2m}{r}\right)^{-1} Q e^{-ikt_s} \quad (17)$$

(see equations (12) and (13)), therefore,

$$h_{03}^p = \frac{i}{k} \left[\left(1 - \frac{2m}{r}\right) Q + r \frac{dQ}{dr^*} \right] e^{-ikt_s} \quad (18)$$

$$h_{13}^p = \left[\frac{i}{k} \sqrt{\frac{2m}{r}} Q + r \left(1 - \frac{2m}{r}\right)^{-1} \left(\frac{i}{k} \sqrt{\frac{2m}{r}} \frac{dQ}{dr^*} + Q \right) \right] e^{-ikt_s} \quad (19)$$

Now, we solve the differential equation (9)

$$\frac{d^2 Q}{dr^{*2}} + [k^2 - V] Q = 0 \quad (20)$$

As proved in reference [3], when $k = ik_2$, $k_2 > 0$, the asymptotic solutions (9) as $r^* \rightarrow \infty$ are $\tilde{A}e^{\pm k_2 r^*}$, and the well-behaved one is $\tilde{A}e^{-k_2 r^*}$, that is,

$$Q_\infty = \tilde{A}e^{-k_2 r^*} \quad (21)$$

and from the equation (9), the solution $\tilde{A}e^{-k_2 r^*}$ cannot become $Ae^{+k_2 r^*}$ as $r^* \rightarrow -\infty$. Therefore the asymptotic solution to $r^* \rightarrow -\infty$ is [3]

$$Q_{2m} = Ae^{-k_2 r^*}. \quad (22)$$

It is easy to see that Q_{2m} is singular at the horizon $r = 2m$, or, $r^* \rightarrow -\infty$. Nevertheless, it may be caused by the ill-behaved-ness of the Schwarzschild metric (1) at the horizon $r = 2m$. We transform the perturbation fields to the Painlevé coordinate system, and will prove the subsequent perturbation fields are initially well-defined at $r = 2m$.

Substituting equation (22) into (18) and (19), and using the transformation equation (2), then, at $r = 2m$, that is, $r^* \rightarrow -\infty$, it is easy to get

$$h_{03}^p(t_p, r) = \frac{1}{k_2} \left[\left(1 - \frac{2m}{r}\right) - k_2 r \right] Ae^{k_2(t_s - r^*)} \quad (23)$$

$$= \frac{1}{k_2} \left[\left(1 - \frac{2m}{r}\right) - k_2 r \right] Ae^{k_2 t_p} e^{k_2[-r + 2\sqrt{2mr} - 4m \ln(1 + \sqrt{\frac{r}{2m}})]} \quad (24)$$

and

$$h_{13}^p(t_p, r) = \frac{1}{k_2} \sqrt{\frac{2m}{r}} Ae^{k_2(t_s - r^*)} + r \left(1 - \frac{2m}{r}\right)^{-1} \left[\frac{1}{k_2} \sqrt{\frac{2m}{r}} (-k_2) + 1 \right] Ae^{k_2(t_s - r^*)} \quad (25)$$

$$= \left[\frac{1}{k_2} \sqrt{\frac{2m}{r}} + r \left(1 + \sqrt{\frac{2m}{r}}\right)^{-1} \right] Ae^{k_2 t_p} e^{k_2[-r + 2\sqrt{2mr} - 4m \ln(1 + \sqrt{\frac{r}{2m}})]}. \quad (26)$$

From equation (24) and (26), it is easy to see that h_{13}^p , h_{03}^p are regular at $r = 2m$ initially (at $t_p = 0$), so, $h_{13}^p(0, r)$ and $h_{03}^p(0, r)$ are regular in $(2m, \infty)$, or $(-\infty, +\infty)$ by r^* . Therefore, the **white-hole-connected universe** of the Schwarzschild space-time is unstable with respect to this kind perturbation.

This completes our proof.

We restate our conclusions again: the **white-hole-connected universe** of the Schwarzschild space-time is unstable with respect to the angular perturbations. Besides, our method could be used in study of the stable problem of Reissner-Nordström black-hole, similar results could be obtained.

Acknowledgments

We are supported in part by the National Science Foundation of China under Grant No.10475013, No.10375087, No.10373003, No.10375008, NKDRTC(2004CB318000) and the post-doctor foundation of China.

References

- [1] T. Regge, J. A. Wheeler, Phys. Rev.*108*, 1063 ,(1970).
- [2] S. Chandrasekhar, The mathematical theory of black hole. Oxford: Oxford University Press,(1983).
- [3] C. V. Vishveshwara, Phys. Rev.*D1*, 2870 ,(1957).
- [4] R. Press, Phys. Rev.*D5*, 2419 ,(1972).
- [5] R. M. Wald, J. Math. Phys.*20*, 1056 ,(1979).
- [6] J. M. Stewart, Proc. R. Soc. *A344*, 65 ,(1975).
- [7] M. K. Parikh, F. Wilczek, Phys. Rev. Lett.*85*, 5042 ,(2000).
- [8] P. Painlevé, C. R. Hebd, Seances Acad. Sci.*173*, 677 ,(1921).
- [9] P. Kraus, F. Wilczek, Mod. Phys. Lett.*A9*, 3713 ,(1994).
- [10] P. Kraus, F. Wilczek, Nucl. Phys.*B433*, 403 ,(1996).